# Effective Governance: Case Study

## Inclusion and Diversity in FE Governing Boards

### Summary

A group of colleges worked together with two National Leaders of Governance with the aim of understanding more about the theory of unconscious bias and its implications for leadership in governance.

### Useful resources

The following materials have been shared to support FE providers seeking to explore inclusion and diversity on their boards.

1. Project Implicit
   https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/uk/background/index.jsp

2. *Inclusion Nudges* by T.C. Nielsen and L. Kepinski

3. Icebreaker activity: Myths and Truths, Inclusion & Diversity (Appendix 1)

4. Blind screening in the recruitment process (Appendix 2)

5. Two stage interviews (Appendix 3)

6. Diversity Questionnaire (Appendix 4)

The materials in Appendices 1 – 4 were produced by Shirley Collier and Pauline Odulinski

# Appendix 1
# Myths and Truths: Inclusion and Diversity
## Purpose

To help people understand the difference between what inclusion is and is not, and to enable dialogue on the topic of inclusion.

Time Allocation – 5 minutes per question

Participants will be asked a question, and then asked to show they agree or disagree by holding up a paddle with AGREE in green on one side, and DISAGREE in red on the other.

After each question there will be a facilitated debate and dialogue. The questions are designed to get a mix of agreement and disagreement from participants. The aim is to engage participants on the topic of inclusion so they can understand different perspectives on the topic, and have a better sense of what inclusion is and what it is not.

## Impact

An excellent way to get at 'hearts and minds' on the topic of inclusion

Good as an exercise to setting context prior to skill building inclusion activities

Opens up dialogue about views

Can encourage people to go away and do something for their own college

## Questions and Considerations

### 1. Diversity and Inclusion are not an issue in our college

False – There is evidence that in most colleges there are some students who 'feel that they cannot be present as who they are.' This is generally evidenced through surveys where there are no declared differences identified for certain characteristics e.g. transgender.

### 2. Equality and diversity is just about political correctness

False- It's about more than trying not to offend or doing the right thing. It's about fairness in terms of access to employment and services, it's about the freedom from discrimination. Equality and Diversity policies and initiatives help to put these widely held values into action.

Example -A hospital trust introduced value based recruitment for staff and reduced sickness absence by 2%, turnover by 7% and recruitment costs by 40%.

### 3. Inclusion only a problem for underrepresented groups

False – The Equality Act 2010 applies to all individuals, providers of services and employers. We live in a complex society made up of people from diverse backgrounds and with a range of needs and requirements. This means someone may be seen as advantaged in some areas and, at the same time, disadvantaged in others.
For example, about 77 % of the NHS workforce is female, but women are underrepresented in senior roles.

### 4. Equality and diversity is just about ticking boxes

False - While tick boxes are one of the ways of collecting data in an organisation such as a college, equality and diversity is about translating that data into information that can inform change. What doesn't get measured doesn't get done- equality and diversity needs to be measured and monitored so that issues are identified and action is taken.

For example, a college used monitoring data to benchmark itself against the changing demographics of the population and against other colleges. It realised from the evidence that it needed to find out more about disability to ensure disabled staff were appropriately supported and represented.

### 5. There is no evidence that it has an impact on the student experience

False - People perform best when they can be themselves and embedding equality and diversity in everything the sector does will improve conditions for all staff and, ultimately, their students and other customers.

For example, an Aston Business School study found that where high numbers of staff from Black and Minority Ethnic background reported experiencing discrimination at work, this coincided with lover levels of student satisfaction. Conversely, student satisfaction was highest where there were fewer reported incidents of workplace discrimination.

### 6.We are in times of significant financial constraints and Improving equality and diversity won't save us any money

False - In fact, it is costly to the sector not to pursue workforce diversity and improving diversity can have a positive impact on the bottom line.

For example, Employment Tribunal Service statistics for 2010/11 show that average payouts were £30,289 for age discrimination, £14,137 for disability discrimination and £13,911 for sex discrimination.

Evidence from the private sector in 2007 shows that among the top performing European companies, those with the highest level of gender diversity in top-level posts outperformed their sector in terms of investment returns.

### 7. It's an issue for the executive leaders, frontline staff can't change anything

False - A personal, fair and diverse workforce is one where everyone's contribution matters and everyone counts. Leadership in this area is crucial at all levels.

Governance and senior leadership is needed, to make equality a core part of quality service delivery to our customers.

Middle management is vital for putting this into practice, and all staff should be able to identify little things they can do in their day-to-day roles to put students first and ensure that everyone has equal opportunities and treatment.

For example, a regional college has appointed a Diversity Champion to their college board. They are working with students and staff to put on a Diversity Festival to promote diversity through crafts, dance, food, song and literature based on cultural ethnicity, and backgrounds. It also includes interests from different ages and some personal profiles with people speaking from interesting different experiences of life.

e.g.  Going to Cambridge University yet coming from a poor social background where there was little support for books, cultural experiences etc.

## Appendix 2

## Blind screening in the recruitment process

### Why

Often, the screening/evaluation process for a new hire or promotion is influenced by such visual impressions as the layout and style of a resume or application, as well as by implicit associations to gender, skin colour, age and other biases. This is also the case in the analysis of test results, in interviews and in the selection process. To ensure a fair process and selection of the best candidates, it is crucial to design the process to be as objective as possible. Unconscious bias awareness and intercultural intelligence are not enough to make the screening and selection process objective. It is necessary to implement steps that help the brain make better decisions and reduce the negative impact of biases - challenging the behavioural drivers of 'status quo', 'mindless choice' and 'confirmation bias'.

### The Inclusion Nudge

Make candidates anonymous in the evaluation and selection process by removing as much identity data as possible.

### How

There are different opportunities to integrate this intervention as part of existing organisational process and systems:

- In the e-recruiting system demographic identity factors such as gender, age, name and photo are not revealed to the recruiting panel during the first screening process. Only when the candidates for interviewing have been selected is identity information given to the recruiting panel.

- When resumes come in, have an assistant manually remove names and geographic information, assigning each resume a number. When possible, ask applicants to submit their resume using a template you have designed, so that layout is consistent.

- Provide screening tests electronically, and have all submissions formatted with consistent styling, again with names removed and replaced by a number.

- Require that search agencies deliver candidates on long/short lists anonymously. Require information about the search agency's screening criteria for the long list. Always require diverse candidates, gender as a minimum.

- Have one member of the recruiting team interview candidates by phone. Experience shows that this person will often have a different perspective on the candidate because the evaluation is not being 'distracted' by looks and gestures.

## Impact

More diversity in the final pool due to a more objective process, thus a better chance of selecting the best qualified candidate and promoting equal opportunity and diversity.

# Appendix 3

## Two stage interviews

### Why

We are often seduced by those who are culturally recognisable to us, who fit the organisational norm and the norm for how to behave in an interview. Research shows that we ask such candidates less critical questions, but more guide and encourage with micro gestures, while failing to guide those we instinctively rate as no-candidates, thereby giving them poor opportunity to perform at interview. It is a challenge to change this during the interview because this is happening in the unconscious automatic system of the brain.

### The Inclusive Nudge

Split the interview into two parts.

The second part is a brief evaluation with the candidate. The nudge makes it easier to challenge assumptions about the candidate because the panel get a second chance to talk to them and seek out facts to counter the assumptions/ stereotypes/ biases, and improves the comparison of the candidates after the interview process.

### How

- Inform the candidates beforehand

- Part one is a regular interview

- Mid-way evaluation: The recruiter and diverse panel leave the room and make an immediate five-minute evaluation of strong and weak sides, questions they didn't ask (re screening criteria) or answers they didn't get. They also flag implicit associations to each other and challenge those by asking questions like:

*"If 'he' was a 'she' would we have thought the same thing?"*
Or
*"'If he had not had a two year break we would have...."*
Or
*"If he didn't have such a soft voice, would we have listened differently?"*
Or
*"If she had the same education as me, would I have...?"*

- Part two is short (10 minutes) evaluation with the candidate

- Final evaluation: The panel makes the final evaluation without the candidate

- The panel discuss the rejection arguments in relation to the selection and screening criteria.

## Impact

- Where this has been used people report that the process makes a difference because they often experience it is like meeting a different person/ candidate in the second part of the interview, (now they know each other, not so uncomfortable, the candidate is less nervous) and that their first immediate perception of the candidate changes.

- The intervention helps the brain shift mode of thinking, raise the level of reflection on emotional- orientated/ biased assumptions.

- Reduces the tendency to primarily consider information that tends to confirm assumptions.

- Reduces the risk of being seduced by candidates who are good at interviews, and gives a second chance to ask critical questions.

- Improves the ground for comparison after the final evaluations of all the candidates.

## Appendix 4

## Diversity Questionnaire

March 2018

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| In which year is the UK population set to top the 70M figure? | There are more than twice the number of Asian and Asian/British people in UK as there are Black/African Caribbean and Black/British people - True or False? | Which Jewish man survived Nazi concentration camps to go on and become a world-renowned author and identifier of Nazi War Criminals? | Black history month is celebrated in which month? |
| Hate crime is targeted at groups with particular characteristics. Put them in order with the most targeted first and the least targeted last: <br>• disability <br>• race/ethnicity <br>• trans-gender identity <br>• religion <br>• sexual orientation | Who was the first female head of government to be democratically elected in a Muslim state? | According to National Statistics, mixed race people will be the largest minority group in the UK by 2020.  Can you name three UK politicians who are mixed race: <br>1._____ <br>2._____ <br>3._____ | After English, what is the most commonly spoken language in Britain? |
| If the earth's population were shrunk to a village of just 100 people, and all the existing ratios remained the same, how many of them would have a college education? | The pink triangle symbol associated with homosexuality originated in <br>A Austria <br>B Germany <br>C Greenwich Village <br>D San Francisco | Who is the President of the European Council? | 9% of the countries who are currently members of the United Nations are currently headed up by a woman (either as President or Prime Minister).  What is the actual number? |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| According to an article in the Guardian on 26 Oct 2017, and based on ONS statistics, the UK population is set to pass 70 million by mid-2029. | The most recent Census (2011) highlights that in England and Wales, 80 per cent of the population were white British.<br><br>Asian (Pakistani, Indian, Bangladeshi, other) groups made up 6.8 per cent of the population; Black groups 3.4 per cent; Chinese groups 0.7 cent, Arab groups 0.4 per cent and Other groups 0.6 per cent.<br><br>Reported by Institute for Race Relations | Simon Wiesenthal | Black history month is celebrated in October in the UK. |
| The number of hate crime offences in the UK in 2016/17 were as follows:<br>62,685 (78%) were race hate crimes;<br>9,157 (11%) were sexual orientation hate crimes;<br>5,949 (7%) were religious hate crimes;<br>5,558 (7%) were disability hate crimes;<br>1,248 (2%) were transgender hate crimes | Benazir Bhutto was elected Prime Minister of Pakistan in 1988. She served as Prime Minister twice;1988-1990 and 1993-96. | Three MPs who are multi-racial:<br>1. Rosena Allin-Khan (Labour, Tooting, elected 2016)<br>2. Clive Lewis (Labour, Norwich South, elected 2015)<br>3. Seema Kennedy (Cons, South Ribble, elected 2015) | Polish is now the main language spoken in England after English, according to 2011 census data released by the Office for National Statistics and published in the Guardian on 30 January 2013. |
| If the earth's population were shrunk to a village of just 100 people, and all the existing ratios remained the same, only 1 of them would have a college education. | The pink triangle symbol associated with homosexuality originated in Germany. | Donald Tusk is the President of the European Council. | 9% of the 193 countries who are currently members of the United Nations are currently headed up by a woman (either as President or Prime Minister).<br><br>The actual number is 16.<br><br>Source<br>http://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/SN01250 |